Teaching and Learning: A Critical Review of What Works

Robert G. Bringle, Ph.D. Phil.D.

Senior Scholar, IUPUI Center for Service and Learning
Chancellor’s Professor Emeritus of Psychology and Philanthropic Studies

rbringle@iupui.edu
Different Approaches to Teaching

• Going through the motions
• Good enough teaching
• Sincere teaching
• Scholarly teaching
• Scholarship of teaching and learning (SoTL)
What Works? Tanner (2016)

- The phrase implies the speaker has solutions that will be immediately applicable in all contexts.
- Ignores individual students and their brains as key variables.
- Assumes uniformity in instructor experience and skill.
- Requires defining what is meant by “works” (e.g., short-term vs. long-term; shallow vs. deep).
- What is the “what” (i.e., fidelity of implementation)
Marchese

• Active learning
• Frequent feedback
• Collaboration
• Cognitive apprenticeship (i.e., mentored relationships in which students can discuss and learn generalization of principles, transfer of knowledge between theory and practice, and analysis of perplexing circumstances)
• Practical applications that involve students in tasks that have real consequences with a safety net as a buffer against high-stakes mistakes
High Impact Practices (Kuh)

- First-year seminars and experiences
- Common intellectual experience
- Learning communities
- Writing-intensive courses
- Collaborative assignments and projects
High Impact Practices (Kuh)

- Undergraduate research
- Diversity/global learning
- Service learning
- Internships
- Capstone courses and projects
HIPs Work Because . . .

- Higher expectations for student achievement
- They result in enhanced time and effort by students
- They produce greater student engagement with faculty and peers
- They provide opportunities for more frequent feedback
- They help students reflect on and integrate their learning
HIPs Work Because . . .

- They can increase student interactions with diverse others,
- They result in the transfer of learning to other settings,
- They result in enhanced clarity about students’ educational and life goals
Community-Based Learning

Not all community-based instruction is service learning

- Field work experiences (e.g., Museum Studies, Anthropology)
- Cooperative Education
- Internship
- Practicum
- Work-integrated learning

- Service Learning
  - Pre-professional field experiences: Clinicals, Student Teaching
  - Applied Learning
Faculty and Student Activities In the Community

Distance Education & Community-Based Learning

Teaching

Research

Service Learning

Professional Community Service/Voluntary Community Service

Participatory Action Research

Community-Based Research

Engagement

Community
Definition

Service learning is a course-based, credit-bearing educational experience in which students

a) participate in mutually identified and organized service activities that benefit the community, and

b) reflect on the service activity in such a way as to gain further understanding of course content, a broader appreciation of the discipline, and an enhanced sense of personal values and civic responsibility.

(adapted from Bringle & Hatcher, 1995)
Service learning is a **course-based, credit-bearing** educational experience in which students

a) participate in mutually identified and organized service activities that benefit the community, and

b) reflect on the service activity in such a way as to gain further understanding of course content, a broader appreciation of the discipline, and an enhanced sense of personal values and civic responsibility.

(adapted from Bringle & Hatcher, 1995)
Balance in Service Learning

s L

S I

S L

S-L
Rationales for Service Learning

- Enhance academic learning
- Student-oriented instruction
Teaching → Learning

“a college's purpose is not to transfer knowledge but to create environments and experiences that bring students to discover and construct knowledge … to make students members of communities of learners that . . . solve problems”

Barr & Tagg (1995)
Sage on the stage →

Guide on the side
Rationales for Service Learning

• Enhance academic learning

• Student-oriented instruction

• Social justice, systemic change

• Civic and democratic learning
Democratic Processes

• Fair

• Inclusive

• Participatory
Definition

Service learning is a course-based, credit-bearing educational experience in which students

a) **participate in mutually identified and organized service activities that benefit the community**, and

b) reflect on the service activity in such a way as to gain further understanding of course content, a broader appreciation of the discipline, and an enhanced sense of personal values and civic responsibility.

(adapted from Bringle & Hatcher, 1995)
Robert Sigmon

- All teach, and all learn
- All serve, and all are served
Barber

The language of charity drives a wedge between self-interest and altruism, leading students to believe that service is a matter of sacrificing private interests to moral virtue, whereas . . .
the language of citizenship suggests that self-interests are always embedded in communities of action and that in serving neighbors one also serves oneself.
Aristotle

- If you want to learn to play the harp, play the harp. If you want to learn to build a house, build a house. And, if you want to teach justice, be just.

- If you want to teach democratic civic skills, involve students in activities that reflect democratic values and in partnerships that are democratic.
Definition

Service learning is a course-based, credit-bearing educational experience in which students

a) participate in mutually identified and organized service activities that benefit the community, and

b) reflect on the service activity in such a way as to gain further understanding of course content, a broader appreciation of the discipline, and an enhanced sense of personal values and civic responsibility.

(adapted from Bringle & Hatcher, 1995)
From A Student’s Journal

Today I got to the nursing home at 2:00. Talked to some ladies. Passed out popcorn at the movie. Went home at 4:00
But, in too many cases, our students

“… had the experience, but missed the meaning.”

T.S. Eliot, *Four Quartets* (1943)
Guidelines for Reflection

- Clearly **links** activity to learning objectives
- Is **structured** in terms of expectations, assessment criteria
- Occurs **regularly** throughout semester
- Instructor provides **feedback**
- Includes opportunity to explore, clarify, and alter **values**

(Bringle & Hatcher, 1999)
Articulated Learning (AL)

• What did I learn?
• How did I learn it?
• Why does it matter/why is it important?
• In what ways will I use this learning/what goals will I set to improve (my learning, my service)
Service learning is a course-based, credit-bearing educational experience in which students

a) participate in mutually identified and organized service activities that benefit the community, and

b) reflect on the service activity in such a way as to gain further understanding of course content, a broader appreciation of the discipline, and an **enhanced sense of personal values and civic responsibility**.

(Adapted from Bringle & Hatcher, 1995)
Not only “serving to learn” → which is applied learning

But also “learning to serve” → which is civic education
Why do we need more than a vocational education? In part, because we live more than a vocational life: we live a larger civic life and we have to be educated for it.

- D. Mathews
What is Good Citizenship?

Battistoni (2002)

• Civic Professionalism
• Social Responsibility
• Social Justice
• Connected Knowing: Ethic of Care
• Public Leadership
• Public Intellectual
• Engaged/Public Scholarship
Values
Attitudes
Skills
Knowledge and Critical Understanding
# Service Learning vs. Internship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service Learning</th>
<th>Internships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Balance between content and activities.</td>
<td>Heavy emphasis on activity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Clear link of activity to course content</td>
<td>Little course content (maybe past courses)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Emphasis on regular, structured reflection</td>
<td>Little, if any, reflection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Includes civic learning</td>
<td>Focus solely on career preparation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Assessment of learning</td>
<td>Assessment of activities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“There are disadvantages to being successful and not knowing why. Not knowing what contributes to an exceptional performance makes an institution vulnerable to losing over time what made it successful in the first place” (Kuh et al., 2010, p. 18).
The Scientist-Educator Model

- Apply research outcomes to course design
- Assess pedagogical effectiveness
- Acquire technological competence
At best, assessment is a process of discovery, a way to enhance teaching and learning, and an opportunity to highlight successful strategies that are already in place at our institutions. To give assessment the makeover it deserves, faculty members must engage in the process with a genuine sense of curiosity. We must ask ourselves what we want to know about student achievement and about how well our measurements of that achievement are working. Furthermore, we must share with our colleagues the ways in which our own teaching practices and philosophies have evolved based on the evidence we have gathered. In that context, assessment truly becomes an opportunity for learning—and for teaching.
A well-functioning, viable society is one in which members are

- well-informed about community issues
- participate in various ways in contributing to work around those community issues
- the quality of life is improved as a result of their involvement